Particulated Autologous Chondral–Platelet-Rich Plasma Matrix Implantation (PACI) for Treatment of Full-Thickness Cartilage Osteochondral Defects



Ramón Cugat, M.D., Ph.D., Gonzalo Samitier, M.D., Ph.D., Gustavo Vinagre, M.D., Ph.D., Maria Sava, B.S., Eduard Alentorn-Geli, M.D., Ph.D.,

Montserrat García-Balletbó, M.D., Ph.D., Xavier Cuscó, M.D., Roberto Seijas, M.D., Ph.D., David Barastegui, M.D., Ph.D., Jordi Navarro, and Patricia Laiz

Abstract: Articular hyaline cartilage injuries can occur as a result of either traumatic of progressive degeneration. When the articular cartilage in a joint is damaged, it can cause joint pain and dysfunction, predisposing patients for the development of early-onset osteoarthritis. There are many restoration procedures available to treat these injuries, such as bone marrow—stimulation techniques, osteoarticular auto/allograft transplants, and autologous chondrocyte implantation. Each of these techniques has its own limitations, which led researchers to explore new regenerative and repair techniques to produce normal hyaline cartilage. The purpose of this Technical Note is to describe in detail the particulated autologous chondral—platelet-rich plasma matrix implantation (PACI) technique that could be used as a single-stage cartilage restoration procedure for treatment of full-thickness cartilage and osteochondral defects.

A rticular hyaline cartilage injuries can occur as a result of either traumatic of progressive degeneration. When the articular cartilage in a joint is damaged, it can cause joint pain and dysfunction, predisposing patients for the development of early-onset osteoarthritis. These lesions present a challenging clinical problem due to the inherent poor healing and regenerative potential of hyaline cartilage. Currently, several restoration procedures for chondral defects have

Received August 3, 2020; accepted October 20, 2020.

Address correspondence to Gustavo Vinagre, M.D., Ph.D., Department of Orthopaedic Surgery, Aspetar Orthopaedic and Sports Medicine Hospital, Doha, Qatar. E-mail: gustavovinagre@gustavovinagre.com

© 2020 by the Arthroscopy Association of North America. Published by Elsevier. This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (http:// creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/).

2212-6287/201348

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eats.2020.10.038

been used, including bone marrow stimulation technique aimed at intrinsic reparative mechanisms, cell-based techniques such as autologous chondrocyte implantation (ACI), and osteoarticular auto/allografts to fill and restore cartilage defects.¹ Each of these repair procedures has its own shortcomings, including fibrocartilage formation, necessity for two surgical procedures, long recovery time, or high variability in time to return-to-play and durability of repair tissues.^{2,3} These limitations have led researchers to explore new regenerative and repair techniques to produce normal hyaline cartilage in the chondral and osteochondral defects.

ACI is an established and well-accepted procedure for the treatment of localized full-thickness cartilage defects of the knee. ACI results in a greater proportion of hyaline-like tissue in histologic, mechanical, and clinical aspects. It has a beneficial effect on durability and appears to be effective in larger lesions.³ ACI relies on the in vitro expansion of patient's chondrocytes, a 3to 4-week process, which is associated with cellular dedifferentiation, impairing the quality of regenerated tissue.⁴ Disadvantages of ACI include multiple interventions, longer time to return-to-activity, high cell-producing cost, and lack of availability in various countries.⁵

Recently, many researchers looked into applying particulated juvenile allograft cartilage (PJAC).

From the Instituto Cugat, Hospital Quironsalud Barcelona, Spain (R.C., G.S., E.A.-G., M.G.-B., X.C., R.S., D.B.); Fundación García Cugat, Barcelona, Spain (R.C., E.A.-G., M.G.-B., X.C., R.S., J.N., P.L.); Department of Orthopaedic Surgery, Aspetar Orthopaedic and Sports Medicine Hospital, Doha, Qatar (G.V.); and Western University oh Health Sciences, Pomona, California, U.S.A. (M.S.).

The authors report the following potential conflicts of interest or sources of funding: R.C. and the Ramón Cugat Foundation receive research support from Smith \mathcal{P} Nephew. G.S. is a paid consultant for Smith \mathcal{P} Nephew. Full ICMJE author disclosure forms are available for this article online, as supplementary material.

Immature chondrocytes have stronger ability to regenerate hyaline-like tissue, which is crucial for the repair of cartilage defects. DeNovo NT (Zimmer Biomet, Warsaw, IN) is a prepackaged PJAC containing 30 to 200 PJAC pieces from only one donor 2 to 12 years old.⁶ In an animal study in 2019, Ao et al.⁶ compared the repair effect of autologous cartilage chips and PJAC on cartilage defects in 30 Guizhou minipigs and reported autologous cartilage chip was better than that of PJAC at 1 and 3 months postoperatively but demonstrated no statistical difference at 6 months. A comparative study of patients who received DeNovo NT graft for treatment of osteochondral lesions of the talus with those of patients who underwent microfracture reported postoperative functional outcomes and quality of repair on MRI were similar with no significant differences in outcome scores between the 2 groups.⁷

The use of minced or particulated cartilage chips has attracted wide attention, as it could overcome the limitations of ACI. This technique was first described by Albrecht et al.⁸ in 1982 and many authors have contributed to its development in the following years.^{9,10} Studies in animal models by Lu et al.¹⁰ have shown that the use of minced cartilage without cell cultures resulted in uniform chondrocyte outgrowth by 6 weeks with formation of new extracellular matrix. The ability of cells to outgrow is characterized by their ability to deposit new extracellular matrix (ECM). These promising results are due to the ability of particulated articular chondrocytes to migrate into a biomaterial and synthesize new ECM.¹¹

Researchers have looked into parameters that could influence chondrocytes to deposit extracellular matrix. The degree of chondral fragmentation is believed to be an important parameter for the amount of ECM production in vitro.¹² If the cartilage chips are too large, the surface is too small for the chondrocytes to become active. Bonasia et al.¹³ reported that a paste-like appearance provides optimal circumstances for the generation of high-quality repair tissue. Levinson et al.¹⁴ conducted an in vitro study using device-minced human cartilage, and their findings reported similar results to hand-minced cartilage, with >50% of the cells being alive enough to observe outgrowth from tissue, while providing a faster and more efficient clinical procedure.

No consensus exists on the nature of the biomaterial to be used to promote chondrocyte migration. Proteinbased scaffolds, such as collagen and fibrin, serve as adhesion sites for chondrocytes to achieve fibrocartilage repair. In vivo evaluation of autologous cartilage fragments incorporated with platelet-rich plasma (PRP) scaffolds promoted not only cell migration but also served as a bioactive scaffold in promoting chondrocyte viability, proliferation, and differentiation.¹⁵ PRP scaffold acts as a reservoir of growth factors and cytokines and is more bioactive than collagen membrane or synthetic meshes.

Platelet products have been well studied due to their intrinsic capacity to induce endogenous reparative and regenerative mechanisms when administered both in vitro and in vivo. PRP preparation augment the 3 phases of tissue healing: inflammation, cell proliferation, and remodeling. Unlike single targeted biological therapies, PRP is one of the few therapies that contains several bioactive factors that are able to induce cell migration and recovery.¹⁶ Although treatments based on PRP have been shown to produce favorable results, there are still controversies of its clinical application. Various compositions, production methods, status of platelet activation, and administration of these factors (loaded in a scaffold or soluble in the culture medium) have been reported in literature, which can explain the variable efficiency of PRP use.¹⁴⁻¹⁶ It is therefore imperative to develop a consistent method that can ensure standardized PRP preparations for expected biological responses.

This Technical Note details a single-stage particulated autologous matrix-enhanced chondral transplantation for treatment of cases with chondral and osteochondral defects (Table 1), especially grades 3 to 4 regarding the classification of the International Cartilage Repair Society (Table 2). This technique harvests cartilage tissue from the chondral defect and combines it with PRP scaffolds. PRP scaffold serves as a bioactive component to interact with embedded cartilage fragments, which induces migration, proliferation, and differentiation of chondrocytes to facilitate cartilage repair. We entitle this technique as particulated autologous chondral-PRP matrix implantation (PACI).

Surgical Technique (With Video Illustration)

The PACI surgical technique uses particulated cartilage mixed with PRP, getting a malleable scaffold that was implanted to cover the chondral defects. The procedure is performed using a combination of arthroscopy and mini-open arthrotomy (Video 1).

Table 1. Indications and Contraindications for theParticulated Autologous Chondral-PRP Matrix Implantation(PACI) Technique

Indications	Contraindications
 Younger patients, up to 40 years of age Full-thickness chondral or osteochondral defects Medium (10-15 mm) to large (>15 mm) chondral defect size with preserved cartilage International Cartilage Repair Society grades 3 to 4 lesions 	 Active infection at surgical site Diffuse osteoarthritis Malalignment Morbid obesity Patient noncompliance

PRP, platelet-rich plasma.

Table 2. International Cartilage Repair Society Classification

 for Osteochondral Lesions

Grade	Criteria
Grade I	Stable, superficial lesions
Grade II	Stable on probing, partial discontinuity, <50% cartilage depth
Grade III	Complete discontinuity, nondislocated, >50% cartilage depth
Grade IV	Dislocated fragment, loose within bed or empty defect through the subchondral bone

Samples of healthy hyaline cartilage are harvested from defect edges using a shaver and curette, and prepared at the back table (Fig 1A). A BTI System IV (BTI Biotechnology Institute, Vitoria-Gasteiz, Spain) is used to centrifugate eight 9-mL tubes containing the patient's blood extracted before surgery. The centrifugation process lasts 8 minutes at 580g, obtaining the sedimentation of red and white cells at the bottom and platelets with plasma on the top part of the tubes.¹⁷ The centrifugation process created 2 fractions: fraction 1 is the upper part of the supernatant and is the plasma poor in platelets (PPP), which is placed in BTI 9-mL, sterile-fractionation tubes; fraction 2 is the plasma rich in platelets (i.e., PRP), which is obtained by extracting the layer just over the white cells and placed in other BTI 9-mL, sterile-fractionation tubes. It is paramount to avoid aspiration of white cells when obtaining fraction 2, so that no inflammatory reaction is elicited.

Other pearls and pitfalls should be taken into account for the PACI technique (Table 3).

The growth factors are activated using $CaCl_2$ at a rate of 0.02 mL per milliliter of plasma, maintaining the tubes at room temperature. The activated PPP-PRP at a 50/50 ratio is combined with the minced hyaline cartilage chips acquired from the patient and left for 30 minutes until the semisolid CN-Biomatrix is formed

Table 3. Pearls and Pitfalls of the Particulated AutologousChondral–PRP Matrix Implantation (PACI) Technique

Pearls	Pitfalls
 Create a vertical rim on the cartilage defect In case of osteochondral defects use a thin layer of minced autologous bone graft before implanting the CN-Biomatrix In femoral or tibial loading areas, extend the knee to create compression once the graft has been placed 	 Using minimal amount of cartilage to generate the CN-Biomatrix When obtaining the PRP fraction 2 extract the layer just over the white cells avoiding aspiration of those Wait at least 5 minutes for the Biomatrix to seal
been placed	the defect and prevent

PRP, platelet-rich plasma.

(Fig 1B). The time needed to form the Biomatrix varies according to the room temperature and patients' blood. Next, the chondral defect is debrided and measured (Figs 2A and 3A), and the autologous chondral PRP scaffold is adjusted to defect size. Once the arthrotomy is performed, the autologous combined chondral PRP matrix is applied to fill in the patient's chondral defect (Fig 2B and 3, B and C). The biomatrix is evenly distributed along the defect and left in place for 5 - minutes for adequate adhesion. After setting, the knee is passively ranged under direct dry arthroscopic visualization to assess for graft adherence and stability. Next, the arthrotomy and portals are closed and the remaining of the fraction 2 was intra-articularly injected after activation with CaCl₂.

Complications

Complications may include failure of graft incorporation, graft hypertrophy, and graft delamination as well as the standard risks usually associated with arthroscopy and arthrotomy techniques.



Fig 1. Left knee. Parapatellar open lateral approach. Patient in supine position. Preparation method of the CN-Biomatrix. (A) The healthy hyaline cartilage harvested from the edges of the defect are particulated with a blade or directly obtained with a shaver connected to an aspiration filter. (B) The platelet-rich growth factors preparation is mixed with the hyaline cartilage chips. The mixture is left at room temperature for about 30 minutes until the semisolid state is reached.



Fig 2. Filling of osteochondral **CN-Biomatrix** defect using surgical technique. (A) Dry arthroscopy view of an osteochondral defect in lateral femoral condyle after the lesion is debrided up to the subchondral bone and the edges of the surrounding cartilage are perpendicularly created. (B) Dry arthroscopy view of the osteochondral defect after it has been filled with the semisolid CN-Biomatrix preparation. Note the needle at the top of the image is used to create a film above the defect using the supernatant obtained from the platelet-rich plasma.

Rehabilitation Protocol

Postoperatively, the patient is kept in a nonweightbearing regimen for 4 weeks, followed by a transition to full weight-bearing at approximatively 6 to 8 weeks. Gentle passive flexion—extension exercises are conducted once a day to avoid stiffness for 1 week, progressing to twice a day for the following 2 weeks. Aquatic-based exercises are allowed as soon as skin incisions are healed. Stationary bicycle is typically allowed after 2 to 3 months, running at 4 to 5 months, and return-to-sports no earlier than 7 months, depending on the type of sport, injury, characteristics, and status of the patient.

Discussion

This current surgical Technical Note details the use of PACI for chondral and osteochondral defects. This method is different from other studies in cartilage repair because it relies on the ability of particulate cartilage to migrate and deposit newly synthesized ECM and the use of bioactive processes of PRP scaffold to attract and nourish chondrocytes via growth factors.

Cugat et al.¹⁵ published first 2 cases of full-thickness knee cartilage injuries treated with CN-Biomatrix, an autologous-made scaffold consisting of hyaline cartilage chips combined with a clot of mixed platelet-rich growth factors in a semisolid state. They reported successful outcomes with excellent knee function, pain relief, and return to high-level soccer at preinjury level, and follow-up MRI showed adequate filling of the defect and absence of significant bone edema. The same group confirmed the clinical, functional, and MRIbased based (cartilage repair quality and quantity) outcomes in a first clinical study on 15 patients using PACI.² A histologic and immunohistochemical study of this technique on sheep by Dominguez-Perez et al.¹⁷ demonstrated at 6 months nearly normal hyaline cartilage, consisting of 75% type II collagen and 8% type I collagen. The original technique used in animal studies led to a too rigid matrix that could not be easily



Fig 3. Right knee. Parapatellar open lateral approach. Patient in supine position. (A) Dry arthroscopy view of an osteochondral defect in trochlea after debridement (B) Demonstration of the semisolid CN-Biomatrix state before the intra-articular placement using a mini-arthrotomy. (C) Dry arthroscopy view of the filled osteochondral defect once the CN-Biomatrix has been placed.

adapted to chondral defects and reached a semisolid state quicker. The modified and improved technique has been used in Cugat et al.^{2,15} case reports and studies. A study by Delman et al.¹¹ reported promising initial results using PACI technique in 8 patients with acute osteochondral lesion of talus. The postoperative imaging of a 15-year-old female patient showed graft incorporation, resolution of bony edema, and restoration of articular contour. Sullivan et al.¹⁸ reported the use of a similar autologous cartilage technique in a professional rugby player with return to play at 23 weeks postoperatively and imaging at 16 months showing subchondral plate restoration.

The MOCART (Magnetic Resonance Observation of Cartilage Repair Tissue) scoring system remains the most accepted standardized method for postoperative evaluation of cartilage repair with MRI. Recent studies used a MOCART scoring system and reported average MOCART scores of 59.5 \pm 17.2 points and 64 \pm 14 points.^{19,20} Cugat et al.² reported a mean MOCART score of 70 (a score of 100 represents completely healthy cartilage) at 12 months using PACI technique, which was greater when compared with microfracture and collagen membrane matrix, microfracture, and chitosanbased polymer scaffolding biomaterial, mesenchymal stem cells, and cell-free scaffold with collagen and hydroxyapatite.²¹⁻²³ Massen et al.⁹ reported a mean MOCART score of 40.6 \pm 21.1 at 6 months, and similar results were reported by Christensen et al.²⁴ observed a MOCART score of 52.5 at 1 year after a particulate cartilage procedure, and Niemeyer et al.²⁵ observed a long-term (follow-up of 10.9 years) MOCART score of 44.9 ± 23.6 after first-generation ACI.

Christensen et al.²⁴ used a different technique of application of platelet-rich growth factors, suggesting the application of growth factors may make a significant difference in the quality of the cartilage repair tissue. Trattnig et al.²⁶ reported greater MOCART scores at 24 months (84.4) after applying a cell-free biosynthetic, biodegradable hydrogel implant. It is important to note that cartilage repair process is a lengthy process (>2 years) to generate the final tissue morphology and that MOCART score continuously improves over time. This is supported by studies showing a lower MOCART score at 6 months to 1 year postoperatively as compared with follow-up at 2 years.

We have been applying PACI in more than 150 active patients with full chondral defects for approximatively 5 years. We have encountered good clinical, functional, and MRI-based outcomes. This procedure is performed as a single-stage procedure, is safe and cost effective, and has shown histologic and immunohistochemical similarity to healthy articulate cartilage in previous and ongoing animal studies.¹¹ Osteochondral injuries also can be treated applying the same technique and concepts, combining cancelled bone, PRP matrix and chondral matrix as it was the case for these osteochondritis dissecans lesions in the medial talus.

The clinical outcomes of the patients after treatment with the autologous particulate cartilage procedure are comparable with published results after ACI.^{25,27,28} The advantage of PACI is that it can be applied as a onestage procedure and is a more economical option when compared with ACI. Our technique allows for harvesting donor cartilage from the edge of existing lesion during debridement, and since the cartilage chips expand and create extracellular matrix, it is possible to treat large lesions without increasing the donor site morbidity. The PACI technique may be suited for younger patients, up to the age of 40 years, given that juvenile chondrocytes sustain their reparative potential and retain intrinsic mechanical and structural properties of hyaline cartilage.

A limitation to the published studies is the short clinical follow-up and the results are not entirely comparable with those of previous studies on ACI or microfracture with long-term follow-up of more than 10 years.²⁷ The goal of our study is to present a safe, efficient, low-cost alternative to ACI and other cartilage repair techniques. Our intention is to analyze and describe the outcomes of patients who underwent this surgical procedure. Another limitation to our study is the potential variation of PRP content existing among different preparations. Platelet content and growth factor concentrations, which vary among individuals, may influence therapeutic effects and is an inevitable limitation in using platelet derivatives. It is imperative that future clinical research be conducted in a more standardized manner, minimizing study-to-study variability and ensuring a reproducible methodology.

The risks of this technique include failure of graft to incorporate, necessitating a second cartilage operation, being a technically challenging procedure, and increased operative time.

In conclusion, PACI is a safe and efficient surgical procedure in young, active individuals with fullthickness cartilage or osteochondral defects. It could represent an alternative to ACI or other cartilage repair options. Nevertheless, longer follow-up and comparative trials are needed to further provide evidence and potentially enlarge the scope of application of PACI.

References

- 1. Hunziker EB, Lippuner K, Keel MJB, Shintani N. An educational review of cartilage repair: Precepts & practice—myths & misconceptions—progress & prospects. *Osteoarthr. Cartil* 2015;23:334-350.
- **2.** Cugat R, Alentorn-Geli E, Navarro J, et al. A novel autologous-made matrix using hyaline cartilage chips and platelet-rich growth factors for the treatment of full-thickness cartilage or osteochondral defects: Preliminary results. *J Orthop Surg* 2020;28. 2309499019887547.

- **3.** Richter DL, Schenck RC Jr, Wascher DC, Treme G. Knee articular cartilage repair and restoration techniques: A review of the literature. *Sports Health* 2016;8:153-160.
- **4.** Thompson CL, Plant JCT, Wann AKT, et al. Chondrocyte expansion is associated with loss of primary cilia and disrupted hedgehog signaling. *Eur Cell Mater* 2017;34:128-141.
- **5.** Oussedik S, Tsitskaris K, Parker D. Treatment of articular cartilage lesions of the knee by microfracture or autologous chondrocyte implantation: A systematic review. *Arthroscopy* 2015;31:732-744.
- **6.** Ao Y, Li Z, You Q, Zhang C, Yang L, Duan X. The use of particulated juvenile allograft cartilage for the repair of porcine articular cartilage defects. *Am J Sports Med* 2019;47:2308-2315.
- 7. Karnovsky SC, DeSandis B, Haleem AM, Sofka CM, O'Malley M, Drakos MC. Comparison of juvenile allogenous articular cartilage and bone marrow aspirate concentrate versus microfracture with and without bone marrow aspirate concentrate in arthroscopic treatment of talar osteochondral lesions. *Foot Ankle Int* 2018;39:393-405.
- 8. Albrecht FH. Der Verschluss von Gelenkknorpel-Defekten mittels Knorpelfragmenten und Fibrinkleber. Closure of joint cartilage defects using cartilage fragments and fibrin glue. *Fortschr Med* 1983;101:1650-1652.
- **9.** Massen FK, Inauen CR, Harder LP, Runer A, Preiss S, Salzmann GM. One-step autologous minced cartilage procedure for the treatment of knee joint chondral and osteochondral lesions: A series of 27 patients with 2-year follow-up. *Orthop J Sport Med* 2019;7. 2325967119853773.
- **10.** Lu Y, Dhanaraj S, Wang Z, et al. Minced cartilage without cell culture serves as an effective intraoperative cell source for cartilage repair. *J Orthop Res* 2006;24:1261-1270.
- **11.** Delman C, Wuellner J, Kreulen C, Lundeen G, Giza E. Particulated autograft cartilage implantation for the treatment of osteochondral lesions of the talus: A novel technique. *Foot Ankle Spec* 2018;11:365-371.
- **12.** Bonasia DE, Marmotti A, Mattia S, et al. The degree of chondral fragmentation affects extracellular matrix production in cartilage autograft implantation: An in vitro study. *Arthroscopy* 2015;31:2335-2341.
- **13.** Levinson C, Cavalli E, Sindi DM, et al. Chondrocytes from device-minced articular cartilage show potent outgrowth into fibrin and collagen hydrogels. *Orthop J Sports Med* 2019;7. 2325967119867618.
- 14. Wong CC, Chen CH, Chan WP, et al. Single-stage cartilage repair using platelet-rich fibrin scaffolds with autologous cartilaginous grafts. *Am J Sports Med* 2017;45:3128-3142.
- **15.** Cugat R, Alentorn-Geli E, Steinbacher G, et al. Treatment of knee osteochondral lesions using a novel clot of autologous plasma rich in growth factors mixed with healthy hyaline cartilage chips and intra-articular injection of PRGF. *Case Rep Orthop* 2017;65:1-6.
- **16.** Kreuz PC, Kruger JP, Metzlaff S, et al. Platelet-rich plasma preparation types show impact on chondrogenic differentiation, migration, and proliferation of human

subchondral mesenchymal progenitor cells. *Arthroscopy* 2015;31:1951-1961.

- 17. Dominguez-Perez JM, Fernandez-Sarmiento JA, Aguilar Garcia D, et al. Cartilage regeneration using a novel autologous growth factors-based matrix for full-thickness defects in sheep. *Knee Surg Sports Traumatol Arthrosc* 2018;27:950-961.
- **18.** Sullivan M, Fraser EJ, Linklater J, Harris C, Morgan K. Arthroscopic surgical technique for an acute talar dome osteochondral lesion in a professional rugby league player. *Foot Ankle Spec* 2017;10:263-269.
- **19.** Apprich S, Trattnig S, Welsch, et al. Assessment of articular cartilage repair tissue after matrix-associated autologous chondrocyte transplantation or the micro-fracture technique in the ankle joint using diffusion-weighted imaging at 3 Tesla. *Osteoarthr Cartil* 2012;20: 703-711.
- **20.** Becher C, Zuhlke D, Plaas C, et al. T2-mapping at 3T after microfracture in the treatment of osteochondral defects of the talus at an average follow-up of 8 years. *Knee Surg Sports Traumatal Arthrosc* 2015;23:2406-2412.
- **21.** Astur DC, Lopes JC, Santos MA, et al. Surgical treatment of chondral knee defects using a collagen membrane—autologous matrix-induced chondrogenesis. *Rev Bras Ortop* 2018;53:733-739.
- 22. Steinwachs M, Cavalcanti N, Mauuva Venkatesh Reddy S, et al. Arthroscopic and open treatment of cartilage lesions with BST-CARGEL scaffold and microfracture: A cohort study of consecutive patients. *Knee* 2019;26:174-184.
- 23. Christensen BB, Foldager CB, Jensen J, et al. Poor osteochondral repair by a biomimetic collagen scaffold: 1- to 3- year clinical and radiological follow-up. *Knee Surg Sports Traumatol Arthrosc* 2016;24:2380-2387.
- 24. Christensen BB, Foldager CB, Jensen J, Lind M. Autologous dual tissue transplantation for osteochondral repair: early clinical and radiological results. *Cartilage* 2015;6:166-173.
- **25.** Niemeyer P, Porichis S, Steinwachs M, et al. Long-term outcomes after first-generation autologous chondrocyte implantation for cartilage defects of the knee. *Am J Sports Med* 2014;42:150-157.
- **26.** Teo AQA, Wong KL, Shen L, et al. Equivalent 10-year outcomes after implantation of autologous bone marrow-derived mesenchymal stem cells versus autologous chondrocyte implantation for chondral defects of the knee. *Am J Sports Med* 2019;47:2881-2887.
- 27. Trattnig S, Ohel K, Mlynarik V, et al. Morphological and compositional monitoring of a new cell-free cartilage repair hydrogel technology—GelrinC by MR using semiquantitative MOCART scoring and quantitative T2 index and new zonal T2 index calculation. *Osteoarthr Cartilage* 2015;23:2224-2232.
- 28. DiBartola AC, Wright BM, Magnussen RA, Flanigan DC. Clinical outcomes after autologous chondrocyte implantation in adolescents' knees: A systematic review. *Arthroscopy* 2016;32:1905-1916.